



CENTRAL YORK FIRE SERVICES

March 18, 2015

CENTRAL YORK FIRE SERVICES REPORT 2015-04

TO: Joint Council Committee

SUBJECT: Draft Fire Department Master Plan – Implementation Options

ORIGIN: Central York Fire Services – Fire Chief

RECOMMENDATIONS

THAT CYFS Report 2015-04 dated March 18, 2015 regarding proposed options for implementation of recommendations from the July 2014 Fire Department Master Plan Update (FDMPU) be received and the following recommendations be adopted:

- 1. THAT JCC recommend to the Councils of the two municipalities to direct staff to proceed with a land securement process in 2015 for the construction of a new fire station;**
- 2. AND THAT JCC make a recommendation to the Councils of the two municipalities to relocate Administration and Training with the new Suppression crew at the new fifth fire station;**
- 3. AND THAT JCC make a recommendation to the Councils of the two municipalities to adopt a multi-year approach to the hiring of a 7th crew, commencing in approximately 2016;**
- 4. And THAT funds be approved to hire an architectural consultant to undertake the fire station design, including assisting in the site evaluation process, to be funded from Development Charge reserves from the respective municipalities.**

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide the JCC with the financial aspects of the options for the implementation of recommendations from the July 2014 Fire Department Master Plan Update (FDMPU). All options have been annualized.

Budget Impact

A multi-year approach is being considered in an attempt to minimize fluctuations in funding requirements over the next few years. All of the proposed options include the securement of land in 2015.

Summary

The plan will guide the Town of Newmarket and the Town of Aurora Councils in making appropriate decisions concerning the provision of fire prevention and protection services.

Background

The 2014 Fire Department Master Fire Plan Update (FDMPU) is a strategic framework to assist the JCC and the Councils of Newmarket and Aurora to make decisions regarding the provision of fire protection services over the next 5 to 10 years based on local needs, circumstances and community risks.

The delivery of fire protection services includes the optimization of three lines of defense:

1. Public education and prevention
2. Fire safety standards and enforcement; and
3. Emergency response

The FDMPU assessed the current initial response coverage for Central York Fire Services and highlighted three areas, which present significant challenges for a timely initial emergency response. Within the primary response area (Aurora and Newmarket), the three strategic areas identified are the central zone between the two communities, the north portion of Newmarket and the south area of Aurora. A modern facility centrally located would provide an opportunity to improve the CYFS depth of response in the central area between the two communities. The northern portion of Newmarket and the south border area of Aurora are both areas of concern regarding timely emergency response. Efforts to address these issues will be researched and discussed with the JCC.

The Town of Aurora and the Town of Newmarket have become increasingly more urbanized over the past ten years. Residential and commercial growth is expected to continue.

Implementation Options

5th Fire Station

The 2008 Master Fire Plan indicated the need for an additional fire station to be located in the center of the CYFS response area based on development of the area. The analyses within the 2014 FDMPU take into account recent development and also reflect the need for a 5th fire station in the short term. The area of St. John's Sideroad between Bayview and Industrial Parkway was determined to be an optimal location for this station.

The current level of service indicates CYFS will strive to achieve arrival of the first fire apparatus at an incident within 6 minutes of notification 90% of the time. Based on the historical call volumes of the CYFS this additional station would improve initial response from 67% to 77%.

Options for the size, configuration and functional staffing to be housed at the 5th fire station include a number of scenarios:

1. Fire Suppression, Administration, Fire Prevention, Training Divisions

This option requires the largest initial capital outlay for the new station, but is advantageous to the two municipalities because all divisions would be centrally located. Studies indicate

communication and morale is improved when operational staff and support services are located in the same facility.

II. Fire Suppression, Administration and Training Divisions

Under this option, the land requirement is the same as the previously listed option. The key difference is the decreased construction costs of the new station, as the Fire Prevention Division would remain at its current location in Newmarket. By having the Fire Prevention Division remain at station 4-1, construction costs for the new fire station are estimated to be \$700,000 lower for the new station based on a reduction of 1700 square feet at \$400/square foot.

In 2010, prior to the former Newmarket Ops Centre being repurposed as the interim Fire Training Centre, the department hired Stantec Architecture to develop a feasibility study in keeping with the strategic recommendations of the CYFS Master Fire Plan (2008-2017). This property condition assessment identified a number of capital projects at Station 4-1 in Newmarket that remain outstanding to this day. While a number of the identified capital life cycle replacements have been completed, the outstanding items include the emergency generator replacement, driveway reconstruction and HVAC system replacement. Funding of \$245,000 was approved in the 2013 capital budget to undertake these renovations.

With this option to relocate Administration, Training and Suppression to a new facility, there remains a need to complete interior renovations to repurpose the space for the Fire Prevention and Fire Suppression staff. The ground floor at Station 4-1 could be repurposed to adequately accommodate the Fire Prevention Division. An interior renovation of the facility will allow for adequate meeting space and a plans review area, as well as office space for the existing and additional Fire Prevention staff that is anticipated in the near future. This project would also entail a second floor renovation for Fire Suppression with the addition of female locker rooms and washrooms. Funding of \$550,000 was approved in the 2013 capital budget for station 4-1 renovations, in addition to the above noted \$245,000 for major component replacement.

The Training Centre proposed would replicate the space and training props currently available at the interim Fire Training Centre in Newmarket. CYFS would continue to rent training space at the Richmond Hill Training facility for annual "live fire" training exercises at a much lower cost than duplicating the training props at the new fire station in Aurora. Similarly, Seneca College in King City would continue to be used for ice and water rescue training rather than expanding the CYFS training facility to include these specialty training props.

This is the recommended option, as it more efficiently utilizes the available floor space at Station 4-1. While it does not meet the criteria of all support divisions being located with Suppression in the new facility, it is a reasonable alternative, which maximizes current facility space while being the most cost efficient option.

III. Fire Suppression Division only

Locating only a fire suppression crew at the new fire station will require a smaller parcel of land than the other options outlined, as the Administration, Training, and Prevention Divisions would

not be located at this facility. Construction costs would be lower due to smaller spacial requirements. However, more extensive renovation costs to Station 4-1 would be required to suitably accommodate Administration and Prevention staff, previously estimated to be approximately \$1.2 million. This option does not allow for future department growth and is not recommended.

Substantial renovations would also be required to the interim Training Centre (former Newmarket Operations Centre - 620 Timothy Street) unless another suitable training facility was found. As this facility was previously slated for demolition, no capital funds have been spent on the facility in the past 7 years. The building is located on a flood plain and there are potential environmental issues due to the fuel tanks on the site. A full site inspection to determine the extent and cost of repairs remains to be conducted. Newmarket Facilities staff have advised that the building is in need of significant upgrades to the structure, as well as the infrastructure supporting the facility. Required upgrades to the existing Training Centre include general renovations ranging from mold due to window and roof leaks, telecommunication upgrades, and teleconferencing/web-conferences for joint training resources. The existing Training Centre is not centrally located and keeping it in the facility inventory would result in maintaining a total of 6 facilities versus 5 under the recommended option.

There could be alternative locations, using existing or proposed Town facilities that warrant future consideration. The 2010 Stantec report estimated the cost of consolidating the Administration, Fire Prevention, Training and Suppression at Station 4-1 at \$4.6 million due to the required expansion of the current facility. While this solution addressed the office space needs of the department, the property is not adequate to accommodate the required outdoor and interior training space required.

Timing of new fire station

Under all 3 of the above options, the recommended timing of the completion of the construction of the 5th fire station is 2017. Purchasing land and initiating station design in 2015 allows for construction to commence in early 2016 with completion of the facility late in 2017. The longer the 5th fire station is delayed, the risk to the community increases, particularly in the center of the primary response area.

Regardless of the option chosen, it is critical that a strategic land securement be made in 2015 as suitably sized parcels of land are already scarce in the optimal area in Aurora.

Hiring additional fire suppression staff

Options for hiring an additional crew include:

I. Hire 20 additional firefighters over 2 years

Under this option, proposed within the FDMPU, the phased in hiring would be completed and all initial training would be completed by the time the new 5th station is constructed at the end of 2017. This option is the most operationally effective, from the perspective of timing, as the hiring is completed in a shorter duration than the other options presented. This hiring timeframe reduces risk, as it provides a significant increase to the department's depth of

service in a shorter time frame. It does result in higher up-front costs from a budgetary perspective. The FDMPU outlines 8 firefighter positions the first year (2016) and the balance of the crew complement (12 positions) in 2017 to coincide with the completion of the new fire station. This schedule for placing the new crew in service in the shortest timeframe maximizes the level of protection available, has less impact on the Training Division, and reduces the operational risks associated with the other scenarios outlined.

II. Hire 20 additional firefighters over multiple years

A phased implementation plan for additional firefighters provides the benefit of spreading the financial impact over an extended time period. However, the full operational benefits of the additional staffing resources are not realized until the hiring of all required positions is completed. This option also puts added pressure on the Training Division staff to conduct multiple 14-week initial training programs over a number of years.

Hiring additional firefighters over multiple years has the potential to offset some overtime costs, as additional firefighters would be assigned to each platoon yearly. This approach was implemented by Richmond Hill Fire and did prove to be effective from a cost control perspective. This option spreads the cost of hiring the new recruits over multiple years, which has the potential to have a positive impact on budget forecasting. If a multi-year staggered hiring is endorsed by Council, there should also be a proposal for CYFS to monitor their emergency response performance and the option to request the hiring be accelerated should circumstances change significantly.

As an interim measure, after the completion of Station 4-5, existing staffing resources could be relocated to the new station until the full complement of 20 firefighters are hired for the 7th crew. Moving an existing crew from either Station 4-2 in Newmarket or 4-3 in Aurora are options to have the 5th station staffed upon completion if a multi-year hiring approach is utilized. However, reducing the staffing level for a number of years in either of these two stations has the potential to negatively impact the ability of CYFS to timely assemble the appropriate resources outlined in the current level of service. The reduction of the second crew at either station places greater obligation on other responding apparatus to arrive within the 10 minute window for a full first alarm call. The ability for CYFS to meet the required staffing levels is maximized when the two west stations, located in the most densely populated areas of the Central York response area, are fully staffed and the third responding apparatus responds from the new fire station location.

Multiple year hiring could be accomplished using a 3, 4 or 5 year program. By hiring new firefighters in multiples of four each year, all platoons can be equally "upstaffed" and these positions could be assigned to supplement existing staffing levels. Upon the full complement being hired, the new crew would be placed into service. Using a 3 year hiring program, four firefighters could be hired in 2016, eight in 2017 and eight in 2018. This would see the full crew in operation upon completion of basic training of the new recruits approximately mid-2018. "Extending out" the hiring process moves the "in service" date of the new crew to 2019 or 2020, depending on the hiring model chosen and has the potential to reduce staffing at an existing fire station in Aurora or Newmarket for the period of time between Station 4-5 completion and the hiring of the 20 firefighter positions.

Administration, Training and Fire Prevention Staffing Requirements

The Ontario Fire Marshal has indicated that preventing fires through the delivery of education and prevention programs and the use of appropriate fire safety standards and enforcement strategies is the most effective means to further reduce the impacts of fire and fire related injuries.

To support these findings, a budget request for 2.4 support personnel to be hired in 2015 has been submitted for approval. The new positions include an Assistant Deputy Chief, an additional Training Officer, and upgrading the part-time Administrative Assistant position to a full-time position. The Other Operating Budget requests for 2015 include a training initiative and an arbitrated wellness and fitness program. The total budgeted impact on CYFS's 2015 operating budget is \$476,000.

The Assistant Deputy Chief would be responsible to oversee the Training Division, provide an added resource for administering and managing the emergency management program and assist the department management team to manage the overall operations of CYFS. This position also improves senior management succession planning opportunities within CYFS.

The Training Officer would help prepare and deliver training programs to ensure the appropriate level of firefighter training is arranged for existing personnel as well as new recruits. The Office of the Fire Marshal has mandated the transition to newly adopted National Fire Protection Association (NFPA) Professional Qualification Standards from the previous Provincial Guidelines. This Training Officer position is needed to help address the additional workload as well as assist with the backlog of work. The addition of this Training Officer will position the department to assist with the current workload, future challenges, certifications and legislated requirements. Properly trained firefighters are critical to the safety of the community and the effectiveness of CYFS staff. The Ministry of Labor (MOL) routinely investigates issues regarding fire service training and takes action accordingly when there are injuries to firefighters that occur during the performance of their duties. To date CYFS has been subjected to two MOL investigations and one Office of the Fire Marshal investigation relating to training of our staff.

The full-time Administrative Assistant position is currently budgeted at 3 days per week and changing to a full-time position will assist to ensure the administrative functions of the Training and Prevention Divisions will be fulfilled on a more timely and regular basis.

It is recommended that the 4 additional support personnel which were removed from the 2015 budget request be considered in 2016. The annual cost is \$493,000 for the 4 positions, however, a phased in approach over two years could be considered and would reduce the annual request. The addition of a Fire Prevention Inspector and a Fire Prevention Life Safety Educator will reflect Council's continued commitment to optimizing the first two lines of defense;(delivery of fire and life safety programs and code enforcement) and would allow CYFS to ensure compliance with Provincial Regulations for fire inspection cycles. These positions would be the first to be hired under a multi-year hiring approach.

A Network and Communications Coordinator is recommended in the FDMPU to oversee the technology needs of the department and the development of a “technology blueprint”. The current Human Resource position should be upgraded to allow for more time at CYFS. This position is required to monitor WSIB cases, return to work programs, develop job descriptions for all positions, formalize a performance development program and succession planning processes. All of these tasks are identified in the FDMPU. In 2015 a review of the Newmarket Human Resources structure is scheduled to ensure HR are well positioned to deliver the level of services in the required areas, including CYFS. Subject to the results of the review, an allowance for additional support will be requested for consideration.

It is recommended that the hiring of the new firefighter positions be undertaken. The costs will vary depending on the number of firefighters hired and are detailed on Appendix B.

Once the new fire station is completed, annual building maintenance costs are estimated to be approximately \$75,000.

Equipment Costs

The equipment requirements are the same in all outlined options. The main variable is the timing of the acquisitions, which will be spread out to match the hiring schedule selected. The new pumper, estimated at \$710,000 (plus related equipment), should be purchased with sufficient lead-time to ensure it is equipped and operational by the time the construction of the new fire station is completed. Bunker gear and associated Personal Protective Equipment would be purchased as the new firefighters are hired, with an estimated total cost of \$175,000 based on 2015 rates.

Next Steps

In general, CYFS is in agreement with the recommendations in the FDMPU – the need for a 5th station, the need for a 7th crew and the additional support staff. The service level standards outlined in the FDMPU will be reviewed with the consultant (Dillon), prior to the final report being released.

A strategic land acquisition is an important first step under all of the proposed options. The timely construction of an additional fire station, a key component of the FDMPU depends on the fire station being strategically located. The optimal area has been identified and there are few suitably sized parcels of land currently for sale.

The funding options for implementation should be reviewed by the Treasurers of both municipalities and strategies developed for the coordinated use of reserves, development charges and any other additional funding sources.

IMPACT ON THE MASTER FIRE PLAN

This report follows the information outlined in the approved Master Fire Plan (2008 – 2017) and is aligned with the draft 2014 Fire Department Master Plan Update.

CONSULTATION

The recommendations are included in the FDMPU. The Chief Administrative Officers and Treasurers of both municipalities have been involved in discussions on implementation with the Fire Chief and have contributed to this report.

BUDGET IMPACT

An interim solution was proposed for 2015 in Joint CYFS Corporate Services Report – Financial Services 2015-11 which addresses some of the critical staffing issues from the 2008 FDMPU, in order to give JCC time to consider options for the implementation of the proposed new plan.


A future report will review land securement options and the capital financing details for the land and the fire station construction. The retention of architectural services for the design of a new fire station will not impact the budget, as the cost will be funded from the DC reserves of the two municipalities.

Hiring an additional 20 firefighters over multiple years can be accommodated within budget targets set by the two municipalities. Based on the option chosen, staff will be able to provide costing scenarios for consideration.

The implementation options selected by JCC will be submitted for budget approval annually.

CONTACT

For more information on this report, contact: Ian Laing at 905-895-9222, ext. 3001 or via e-mail at ilaing@cyfs.ca



Ian Laing, Fire Chief
Central York Fire Services

IL/DS:nh

Attachments:

- Appendix A: Draft Fire Master Plan Update Options-Capital Considerations
- Appendix B: Draft Fire Master Plan Update Options-Operating Costs

Appendix - A

CENTRAL YORK FIRE SERVICES DRAFT FIRE MASTER PLAN UPDATE OPTIONS Capital Considerations

	2015	2016	2017	2018	TOTAL
In Thousand Dollars					
I.a) 5th Fire Station completed in 2017 with Administration, Training & Prevention					
LAND	\$ 4,550				
SITE PLAN DESIGN	\$ 100				
BUILDING		\$ 2,750	\$ 2,750		
BUNKER GEAR		\$ 87	\$ 88		
PUMPER FOR NEW STATION			\$ 710		
	\$ 4,650	\$ 2,837	\$ 3,548	\$ -	\$ 11,035
I.b) 5th Fire Station completed in 2018 with Administration, Training & Prevention					
LAND	\$ 4,550				
SITE PLAN DESIGN	\$ 100				
BUILDING		\$ 1,840	\$ 1,830	\$ 1,830	
BUNKER GEAR		\$ 58	\$ 58	\$ 59	
PUMPER FOR NEW STATION				\$ 710	
	\$ 4,650	\$ 1,898	\$ 1,888	\$ 2,599	\$ 11,035
II.a) 5th Fire Station completed in 2017 with Administration, Training					
LAND	\$ 4,550				
SITE PLAN DESIGN	\$ 100				
BUILDING		\$ 2,750	\$ 2,050		
BUNKER GEAR		\$ 87	\$ 88		
PUMPER FOR NEW STATION			\$ 710		
RENOVATIONS TO STATION 4-1, FIRE PREVENTION		\$ 400	\$ 400		
	\$ 4,650	\$ 3,237	\$ 3,248	\$ -	\$ 11,135
II.b) 5th Fire Station completed in 2018 with Administration, Training					
LAND	\$ 4,550				
SITE PLAN DESIGN	\$ 100				
BUILDING		\$ 1,600	\$ 1,600	\$ 1,600	
BUNKER GEAR		\$ 58	\$ 58	\$ 59	
PUMPER FOR NEW STATION				\$ 710	
RENOVATIONS TO STN. 4-1, FIRE PREVENTION			\$ 400	\$ 400	
	\$ 4,650	\$ 1,658	\$ 2,058	\$ 2,769	\$ 11,135
III.a) 5th Fire Station completed in 2017 with Suppression only					
LAND	\$ 4,550				
SITE PLAN DESIGN	\$ 100				
BUILDING		\$ 1,500	\$ 1,500		
BUNKER GEAR		\$ 87	\$ 88		
PUMPER FOR NEW STATION			\$ 710		
RENOVATIONS TO STN. 4-1, FIRE PREVENTION & ADMIN.		\$ 400	\$ 400		
RENOVATIONS TO EXISTING TRAINING CENTRE		\$ 375	\$ 375		
	\$ 4,650	\$ 2,362	\$ 3,073	\$ -	\$ 10,085
III.b) 5th Fire Station completed in 2018 with Suppression only					
LAND	\$ 4,550				
SITE PLAN DESIGN	\$ 100				
BUILDING		\$ 1,000	\$ 1,000	\$ 1,000	
BUNKER GEAR		\$ 58	\$ 58	\$ 59	
PUMPER FOR NEW STATION				\$ 710	
RENOVATIONS TO STATION 4-1, FIRE PREVENTION & ADMIN.			\$ 400	\$ 400	
RENOVATIONS TO EXISTING TRAINING CENTRE		\$ 250	\$ 250	\$ 250	
	\$ 4,650	\$ 1,308	\$ 1,708	\$ 2,419	\$ 10,085

Appendix - B

CENTRAL YORK FIRE SERVICES DRAFT FIRE MASTER PLAN UPDATE OPTIONS OPERATING COSTS IN 2015 \$'S

		2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	TOTAL
		in Thousand Dollars						
	2.4 SUPPORT PERSONNEL HIRED IN 2015	\$476						\$476
	4.0 SUPPORT PERSONNEL PHASED IN OVER 2 YEARS		\$247	\$247				\$493
	BUILDING MAINTENANCE COSTS FOR NEW STATION (TIMED WITH COMPLETION OF NEW STATION)			\$75				\$75
ADD 20 FIRE SUPPRESSION STAFF:								
I.	OVER 2 YEARS (ASSUMING 8 AND 12)	\$	\$960	\$1,440				\$2,400
	TOTAL	\$476	\$1,206	\$1,761	\$	\$	\$	\$3,444
	projected tax impact - Newmarket	0.56%	1.43%	2.08%				4.08%
	projected tax impact - Aurora	0.54%	1.36%	1.99%				3.89%
II.a)	OVER 3 YEARS (ASSUMING 4, 8 AND 8)	\$	\$480	\$960	\$960			\$2,400
	TOTAL	\$476	\$726	\$1,281	\$960	\$	\$	\$3,444
	projected tax impact - Newmarket	0.56%	0.86%	1.52%	1.14%			4.08%
	projected tax impact - Aurora	0.54%	0.82%	1.45%	1.08%			3.89%
II.b)	OVER 4 YEARS (ASSUMING 8, 4, 4 AND 4)	\$	\$960	\$480	\$480	\$480		\$2,400
	TOTAL	\$476	\$1,206	\$801	\$480	\$480	\$	\$3,444
	projected tax impact - Newmarket	0.56%	1.43%	0.95%	0.57%	0.57%		4.08%
	projected tax impact - Aurora	0.54%	1.36%	0.91%	0.54%	0.54%		3.89%
II.c)	OVER 4 YEARS (ASSUMING 4, 4, 4 AND 8)	\$	\$480	\$480	\$480	\$960		\$2,400
	TOTAL	\$476	\$726	\$801	\$480	\$960	\$	\$3,444
	projected tax impact - Newmarket	0.56%	0.86%	0.95%	0.57%	1.14%		4.08%
	projected tax impact - Aurora	0.54%	0.82%	0.91%	0.54%	1.08%		3.89%
II.d)	OVER 5 YEARS (ASSUMING 4 PER YEAR)	\$	\$480	\$480	\$480	\$480	\$480	\$2,400
	TOTAL	\$476	\$726	\$801	\$480	\$480	\$480	\$3,444
	projected tax impact - Newmarket	0.56%	0.86%	0.95%	0.57%	0.57%	0.57%	4.08%
	projected tax impact - Aurora	0.54%	0.82%	0.91%	0.54%	0.54%	0.54%	3.89%