

PLANNING AND BUILDING SERVICES Town of Newmarket 395 Mulock Drive P.O. Box 328, STN Main Newmarket, ON L3Y 4X7

www.newmarket.ca planning@newmarket.ca T: 905.953.5321 F: 905.953.5140

TO: Heritage Newmarket Advisory Committee

DATE: April 9, 2019

SUBJECT: Requests for Removal from the Heritage Registry of Non-Designated Properties 578 Lydia Street 270 Prospect Street

For discussion and consideration.

Two property owners have requested their property be removed from the Heritage Registry of Non-Designated Properties with the intent to demolish and rebuild on the lot.

The demolition of a building that is listed on the Register requires Council's approval. Owners of listed properties must give the Council at least 60 days notice of their intention to demolish or remove a building or structure on the property. This allows time for council to decide whether to begin the designation process or consent to the permit request. If Council does not proceed to initiate the process to designate the property, the property will be removed from the Register and the demolition will be permitted. Prior to Council adding or removing properties from the Registry, they must consult with Heritage Newmarket.

578 Lydia Street - Current



Undated file Photo



James Wetherill house (From Registry) Plan 85, Lot 2 C. 1855

Historical Context

Lot was purchased by James Wetherill in 1854.

- Wetherill's son was a charity student of the 1868 Grammar School, and went on to later be a high school teacher.

- Wetherill used the property as security on various mortgages that were obtained to finance the construction of the house.

- In 1865, Donald Sutherland (a prominent merchant) took ownership of the property through default of the first mortgage.

Architectural Context

2 storey wood- frame, vernacular style, residence with vinyl clade exterior

- Gently sloped gable roof.
- Wrap-around porch covered by roof that is supported by Wooden columns.
- Many improvements and/or changes have been made to the house over the years.

270 Prospect Street



John Mitchell House (From Registry) Plan 15, Lot 8 1877

Architectural Context

Single-storey residence with painted brick exterior on a stone rubble foundation.

- Hip roof.

- Small enclosed veranda addition.
- All windows have been replaced.

When evaluating a property for heritage review, the Town has endorsed evaluation criteria consistent with the recommendations from the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport. There are four categories that are reviewed: Design or Physical Value, Contextual Value, Integrity and Historical or Associative Value & Significance. I have provided my comments on both properties below.

Design or Physical Value	578 Lydia Street	270 Prospect Street
Style Is this a notable, rare or unique example of a particular architectural style or type?	No - Vernacular – gable roof – large covered porch	No - Vernacular – Hip roof – veranda addition
Construction Is this a notable, rare, unique or early example of a particular material or method of construction?	No – stone rubble foundation/wood frame construction	No – painted brick exterior/stone rubble foundation

Design Is this a particularly attractive or unique structure because of the merits of its design, composition, craftsmanship or details? Does this structure demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement?	No – simple composition with no defining features Does not display a high degree of technical or scientific achievement	No - simple composition with no defining features Does not display a high degree of technical or scientific achievement
Interior Is the interior arrangement, finish, craftsmanship and/or detail noteworthy?	Unknown	Unknown

Contextual Value Continuity Does this structure contribute to the continuity or character of the street, streetscape, neighbourhood or area?	No – Lydia street has a number of homes of various styles and ages.	No – Prospect Street has a number of homes of various styles and ages.
Setting Is the setting or orientation of the structure or landscaping noteworthy? Landmark IS this a particularly important visual landmark within the Region, Town or neighbourhood?	No – typical setting on a public road. Close to the right of way This property is not a landmark	No – encroaching or nearly encroaching on public right of way This property is not a landmark
Completeness Does this structure have other original outbuildings, notable landscaping or external features that complete the site?	No	No

Integrity		
Site Does the structure occupy its original site?	Yes	Yes
Alterations Does this building contain most of its original materials and design features? Is this a notable structure due to sympathetic alterations that have taken place over time?	Number of alterations over the years	Appears to retain original materials
Condition Is this building in good condition?	Requires structural remediation	Unknown

Historical or Associative Value & Significance		
Does this property or structure have strong associations with and/or contribute to the understanding of a belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant or unique within the Town? Is the original, previous or existing	No	No
use significant?		
Does this property meet the definition of a significant built heritage resource or cultural landscape, as identified in the Provincial Policy Statement under the Ontario Planning Act?		

Staff currently are recommending both properties be removed from the Registry of Non Designated Heritage Properties and the demolition be allowed.

Respectfully,

Davetyle

Dave Ruggle, BAA, MCIP, RPP Senior Planner – Community Planning