



Town of Newmarket
395 Mulock Drive P.O. Box 328,
Newmarket, Ontario, L3Y 4X7

Email: info@newmarket.ca | Website: newmarket.ca | Phone: 905-895-5193

951 Srigley Street Heritage Review Staff Report

Report Number: 2019-21

Department(s): Planning and Building Services

Author(s): D. Ruggle, Senior Planner Community Planning

Meeting Date: February 25, 2019

Recommendations

1. That the report entitled 951 Srigley Street Heritage Review dated February 25, 2019 be received; and,
2. That Council not proceed through a designation process under the Ontario Heritage Act for 951 Srigley Street; and
3. That the Committee of Adjustment be notified of this decision.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide Council information related to the heritage attributes of the property and to recommend to Council that they not proceed to designate this property under the Ontario Heritage Act (OHA).

Background

The owner of 951 Srigley Street has applied to the Committee of Adjustment (COA) to sever the lot with the intent to demolish the existing dwelling and construct two new detached dwellings.

The property is not a Listed Heritage Property in the Town's Register of Heritage Properties of Interest nor Heritage Properties designated under the Act. . Through the above noted Committee of Adjustment process, a concern was raised that the property

has significant heritage value that it should be protected and designated under the Ontario Heritage Act. As no Heritage Newmarket Advisory Committee meetings were scheduled, a request was sent to members by way of e-mail requesting comment on the heritage value of the property. Two members responded indicating they were of the position that the dwelling should be designated under the OHA.

In a memo to the COA dated October 18, 2018, it was requested to defer the above noted application to allow additional time to review the property at 951 Srigley Street from a heritage value perspective. At their meeting on December 12, 2018, Committee of Adjustment again deferred a decision until Council has made a determination to designate the property under the OHA or not peruse designation.

Staff and the Chair of heritage Newmarket have completed a review and the applicant has provided a letter from Philip Goldsmith, Architect and Certified Heritage Professional, which is attached to this Report.

Discussion

Through the staff and Heritage Newmarket review, it appeared the dwelling was constructed in the 1960's by Fraser Milne who was a local architect in Newmarket. Mr. Milne had been the designer/architect for a number of Newmarket buildings starting in the 60's designing the Ray Twinney Complex and the additions to the Town hall on Main Street. The dwelling has a modern/Scandinavian design inspiration (the first of its kind in Newmarket) with the public areas separated from the family area by a link. The 1960/1970's saw an influx of Scandinavian inspired design across Canada. The Chair of Heritage Newmarket is of the opinion that the dwelling has enough heritage value to warrant designation under the Heritage Act.

The letter from Mr. Goldsmith reviews the property against the Provincial criteria under Regulation 9/06 of the OHA. Mr. Goldsmith concludes that in his opinion, this property is not of heritage significance. While there is some associative value related to the architect Fraser Milne, he does not consider it to be significant in the context of the Provincial definition. Noting that the property and dwelling were developed over time and that the dwelling is aesthetically different from its immediate neighbors, it does not hold contextual value as it does not contribute to the overall context of the area.

Under the OHA, Municipal Council has the authority to designate a property as having heritage significance. Prior to making a decision, Council must also request advice from Heritage Newmarket. Council typically also requests a staff report on these matters prior to making a final decision. To date, Council has not made a determination on whether this property should have Heritage Designation under the OHA. To assist in determining if this property should be designated, ERA (the Town's Heritage peer review consultants) have provided a peer review of Mr. Goldsmith's submission. The ERA report is also attached.

ERA's peer review notes some omissions in Mr. Goldsmith's assessment but agree with the overall conclusion that the building does not warrant heritage designation.

In relation to the noted omissions, the peer review notes: "It is ERA's opinion that although not of Heritage Significance as defined by the Ontario Heritage Act, the Property does have value as part of a collection of *modern/ Scandinavian* inspired buildings and designed objects that were once popular and are to be ubiquitously found in the province. Measures could be taken to ensure that a detailed and comprehensive study of the Property is made that complements the recording of histories associated with its design style in Ontario".

ERA suggest that the Town may wish to consider a documentation process that includes measured drawings, photo documentation of the property and a deconstruction process that allows for an examination of existing materials. This process would allow the different stages of the Property's construction to be understood and recorded. The documentary process could also pay particular attention to features that would be considered as heritage attributes if the Property was designated. An element of note is the fireplace added in the 1990s, and research on the design inspiration for this could also be considered. Upon completion of the documentary study arrangements could be made for its inclusion of a publicly accessible municipal archive.

Based on the Heritage Assessment and associated peer review, staff are recommending Council not pursue Heritage Designation on the subject lands.

Municipal Register of Non-Designated Heritage Properties – In 2019, staff along with the newly selected Heritage Newmarket Advisory Committee will review the register with an aim to prioritize properties in terms of heritage value and potential removal of properties from the registry.

Conclusion

Staff are recommending Council not proceed to designate this property under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Business Plan and Strategic Plan Linkages

The recommendations of this report assist the Town in meeting its vision of being:

Well Balanced by ensuring Newmarket's rich built history is acknowledged and preserved through designation and/or documentation.

Consultation

The chair of Heritage Newmarket Advisory Committee has provided his comments on the heritage evaluation of this property.

Human Resource Considerations

N/A

Budget Impact

Describe budget impact (operational/capital/tax levy)

Attachments

Philip Goldsmith Heritage Review

ERA Peer Review Report

Approval

Commissioner, Development & Infrastructure Services

Director of Planning & Building Services

Contact

For more information on this report, contact: Dave Ruggle, Senior Planner – Community Planning, at druggle@newmarket.ca